

JEFFREY H. WOOD, Acting Assistant Attorney General
United States Department of Justice
Environment and Natural Resources Division

JOHN S. MOST, Trial Attorney
Natural Resources Section
P.O. Box 7611 Washington, D.C. 20044
202-616-3353 || 202-305-0506 (fax)
John.Most@usdoj.gov

Counsel for Federal Defendants
(additional counsel appear on pp. 2-4)

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MONTANA
GREAT FALLS DIVISION**

_____)	
STATE OF CALIFORNIA <i>et al.</i> ,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	CV 17-42-BMM
v.)	
)	
RYAN ZINKE <i>et al.</i>)	JOINT MOTION TO
)	CONSOLIDATE ACTIONS
)	AND SET CASE SCHEDULE
Federal Defendants.)	
)	
_____)	

Plaintiffs' Counsel in this Action

ROGER SULLIVAN

DUSTIN LEFTRIDGE

McGarvey, Heberling, Sullivan & Lacey, P.C. 345 1st Ave. E.

Kalispell, Montana 59901-5341

(406) 752-5566

RSullivan@McGarveyLaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs in No. CV 17-42-BMM

XAVIER BECERRA

Attorney General of California

DAVID ZONANA

Supervising Deputy Attorney General

GEORGE TORGUN

(pro hac vice)

ELIZABETH B. RUMSEY

Deputy Attorneys General

1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor

Oakland, CA 94612-0550

Telephone: (510) 879-1002

George.Torgun@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for State of California in No. CV 17-42-BMM

HECTOR BALDERAS

Attorney General of New Mexico

BILL GRANTHAM

Assistant Attorney General

(pro hac vice pending)

201 Third St. NW, Suite 300

Albuquerque, NM 87102

Telephone: (505) 717-3520

wgrantham@nmag.gov

Attorneys for State of New Mexico in No. CV 17-42-BMM

ERIC T. SCHNEIDERMAN
Attorney General of New York
YUEH-RU CHU
Assistant Attorney General
(*pro hac vice*)
Office of the Attorney General
Environmental Protection Bureau
120 Broadway, 26th floor
New York, New York 10271
Telephone: 212-416-6588
Yueh-ru.Chu@ag.ny.gov

Attorneys for State of New York in No. CV 17-42-BMM

ROBERT W. FERGUSON
Attorney General, State of Washington
WILLIAM R. SHERMAN
(*pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
800 5th Ave Suite 2000, TB-14
Seattle, WA 98104-3188
Telephone: (206) 442-4485
Email: bill.sherman@atg.wa.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Washington
in No. CV 17-42-BMM*

Plaintiffs' Counsel in Proposed Lead Action

JENNY HARBINE
Earthjustice
313 East Main Street
Bozeman, MT 59715
jharbine@earthjustice.org
(406) 586-9699 | Phone
(406) 586-9695 | Fax

EDWARD B. ZUKOSKI
(*pro hac vice*)
Earthjustice
633 17th Street, Suite 1600
Denver, CO 80202
tzukoski@earthjustice.org
(303) 623-9466 | Phone
(303) 623-8083 | Fax

*Counsel for Plaintiffs in
No. CV 17-30-BMM*

JOSHUA OSBORNE-KLEIN
(*pro hac vice*)
WYATT F. GOLDING
(*pro hac vice*)
Ziontz Chestnut
2101 Fourth Avenue, Suite 1230
Seattle, WA 98121
joshok@ziontzchestnut.com
wgolding@ziontzchestnut.com
(206) 448-1230 | Phone
(206) 448-0962 | Fax

*Counsel for Plaintiff Northern
Cheyenne Tribe in No. CV 17-
30-BMM*

MICHAEL SAUL
(*pro hac vice*)
Center for Biological Diversity
1536 Wynkoop Street, Suite 421
Denver, CO 80202
MSaul@biologicaldiversity.org
(303) 915-8308 | Phone

ANCHUN JEAN SU
(*pro hac vice*)
Center for Biological Diversity
1212 Broadway, Suite 800
Oakland, CA 94612
jsu@biologicaldiversity.org
(510) 844-7100 | Phone
(510) 844-7150 | Fax

*Counsel for Plaintiff
Center for Biological Diversity
in No. CV 17-30-BMM*

Intervenors' Counsel in Proposed Lead Action

ERIK E. PETERSEN
Wyo. Bar No. 7-5608
ELIZABETH MORRISSEAU
Wyo. Bar No. 7-5307
Sr. Assistant Attorneys General
Wyo. Attorney General's Office
2320 Capitol Avenue
Cheyenne, WY 82002
(307) 777-6946 | Phone
(307) 777-3542 | Fax
erik.petersen@wyo.gov
elizabeth.morrisseau@wyo.gov

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a), and in the interests of judicial economy, the parties to this action hereby jointly move for an order procedurally consolidating this case, *State of California et al. v. Zinke et al.* (“*California*”), No. CV 17-42-BMM (D. Mont., filed May 9, 2011), with *Citizens for Clean Energy et al. v. Zinke et al.* (“*Citizens*”), No. CV 17-30-BMM (D. Mont., filed Mar. 29, 2017). Movants further request that the proposed case schedule set out below, including revised word limits for summary judgment briefing, be adopted by the Court. A similar and corresponding motion, seeking the same result, was filed yesterday in *Citizens*. Movants request that *Citizens*, which was the first case filed, be designated the lead case, to which future filings relevant to either case would be made.

Counsel for Plaintiffs in both actions consent to consolidation for purposes of briefing, hearing, and decision, on the condition that the plaintiff group in this case and the plaintiff group in *Citizens* each be permitted to file their own motions and briefing and have separate time for argument at any hearings. Undersigned counsel for Federal Defendants has conferred with counsel for the State of Wyoming (Defendant-Intervenor in *Citizens*) who states that Wyoming also consents to consolidation and to the schedule and word limits set out below.

In addition, counsel for Federal Defendants has conferred with counsel for two prospective intervenor-movants, the State of Montana and the National Mining

Association, who have indicated their intent to intervene and their consent to consolidation, as well as to the schedule and word limits set out below, in the event that the Court grants the expected intervention motions. In addition, movants note that Wyoming and Montana have indicated their willingness to file consolidated summary judgment briefs, in the event Montana is granted intervention. Thus no more than four intervenor briefs would be expected, two in the opening round (National Mining Association and a consolidated Wyoming/Montana brief) and two in the reply round (same), should intervention be granted.

All parties in both actions agree, and ask the Court to authorize, that the cases proceed in accordance with the schedule and agreed word limits set out below. Movants note that, despite the moderate increases in local rule 7.1(d) word limits for each brief, the total number of words sought is still well below the total limits that would apply if the cases were separately heard and not consolidated.

Further, the parties agree that if either plaintiff group amends its complaint, whether by consent of the parties or leave of Court, no party is precluded from seeking adjustments to the schedule and word limits sought herein. Nor is any party precluded from seeking such adjustments for good cause. Finally, all parties in both actions agree and ask the Court to dispense with the requirement of filing Statements of Undisputed Facts or Statements of Disputed Facts under local rule 56.1(a) and (b).

Preliminary Matters

Deadline for Federal Defendants' Answer to the Complaints in both actions	July 18, 2017
Deadline for any Intervenor's Answers to the Complaints in both actions	July 25, 2017
Deadline for Federal Defendants to serve the administrative record on the parties	August 11, 2017
Deadline for any motions to supplement or complete the record	September 22, 2017
Deadline for Federal Defendants to lodge the administrative record with the Court and, if it has been revised, to serve the revised record on the parties	September 29, 2017

Summary Judgment Briefing

Opening Brief of Plaintiffs in CV-17-30 (9,000 words) ¹	October 20, 2017
Opening Brief of Plaintiffs in CV-17-42 (9,000 words)	October 20, 2017
Federal Defendants' Cross-Motion and Opposition Brief (12,000 words)	November 17, 2017

¹ Word limits set out herein are exclusive of the case caption, table of contents, and table of authorities. Also, references to briefs filed by Intervenor-Defendants are based on an assumption that Montana and the National Mining Association will be granted intervention.

Intervenor-Defendants' Cross-Motions and Opposition Briefs (7,000 words each, total of two briefs)	November 29, 2017
Opposition and Reply Brief of Plaintiff in CV-17-30 (8,000 words)	December 13, 2017
Opposition and Reply Brief of Plaintiffs in CV-17-42 (8,000 words)	December 13, 2017
Federal Defendants' Reply Brief (7,000 words)	January 12, 2018
Intervenor-Defendants' Reply Briefs (4,000 words each, total of two briefs)	January 19, 2018

In support of this motion, movants note that the Court has broad discretion to order consolidation, *see In re Adams Apple, Inc.*, 829 F.2d 1484, 1487 (9th Cir. 1987) (citations omitted), and should do so here because the cases challenge the same Secretarial Order, No. 3348 (Mar. 29, 2017), *see Bixler v. Jackson Nat. Life Ins. Co.*, 2012 WL 877025 (D. Mont. Mar. 14, 2012). The complaints in these two actions each assert two counts claiming similar violations of the National Environmental Policy Act, while the Plaintiff states in this case bring additional claims under the Mineral Leasing Act of 1920 and the Federal Land Policy and Management Act. All of these claims are reviewed under the Administrative Procedure Act, based on the administrative record for the same action (i.e., Secretarial Order 3348).

For all these reasons, movants ask that the two actions be procedurally consolidated, and that the Court approve the schedule and word limits for summary judgment briefing set out above and reflected in the accompanying proposed order.

Respectfully submitted this 1st day of June, 2017,

JEFFREY H. WOOD
Acting Assistant Attorney General
U.S. Department of Justice
Environment and Natural Resources Division

/s/ John S. Most
JOHN S. MOST, Trial Attorney
Natural Resources Section
P.O. Box 7611, Washington, D.C. 20044
202-616-3353 || 202-305-0506 (fax)
john.most@usdoj.gov

Counsel for Federal Defendants

/S/ Roger Sullivan by
John S. Most, with permission
ROGER SULLIVAN
/S/ Dustin Leftridge by
John S. Most, with permission
DUSTIN LEFTRIDGE
McGarvey, Heberling, Sullivan
& Lacey, P.C. 345 1st Ave. E.
Kalispell, Montana 59901-5341
(406) 752-5566
RSullivan@McGarveyLaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs in
No. CV 17-42-BMM

XAVIER BECERRA
Attorney General of California
DAVID ZONANA
Supervising Deputy Attorney General

/S/ George Torgun by
John S. Most, with permission
GEORGE TORGUN
(*pro hac vice*)
ELIZABETH B. RUMSEY
Deputy Attorneys General
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
Telephone: (510) 879-1002
George.Torgun@doj.ca.gov

*Attorneys for State of California
in No. CV 17-42-BMM*

HECTOR BALDERAS
Attorney General of New Mexico
BILL GRANTHAM
Assistant Attorney General
(*pro hac vice pending*)
201 Third St. NW, Suite 300
Albuquerque, NM 87102
Telephone: (505) 717-3520
wgrantham@nmag.gov

*Attorneys for State of New Mexico
in No. CV 17-42-BMM*

ERIC T. SCHNEIDERMAN
Attorney General of New York
YUEH-RU CHU
Assistant Attorney General
(*pro hac vice*)
Office of the Attorney General
Environmental Protection Bureau

120 Broadway, 26th floor
New York, New York 10271
Telephone: 212-416-6588
Yueh-ru.Chu@ag.ny.gov

*Attorneys for State of New York
in No. CV 17-42-BMM*

ROBERT W. FERGUSON
Attorney General, State of Washington
WILLIAM R. SHERMAN
(pro hac vice)
Assistant Attorney General
800 5th Ave Suite 2000, TB-14
Seattle, WA 98104-3188
Telephone: (206) 442-4485
Email: bill.sherman@atg.wa.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Washington
in No. CV 17-42-BMM*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing is being filed with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, thereby serving it on all parties of record this 1st day of June, 2017, and further that, on this same date, a PDF copy of the foregoing is being served by email on counsel for the State of Montana, Ms. Melissa Schlichting (MSchlichting@mt.gov), and counsel for the National Mining Association, Mr. James M. Auslander (JAuslander@bdlaw.com).

/s/ John S. Most

JOHN S. MOST

Counsel for Federal Defendants